« Écosse : l'identité nationale en question / Questioning national identity »
VIe colloque de la SFEE – Université de Nantes, 12 et 13 octobre 2007

1

Écosse :
l'identité nationale
en question

Questioning
national identity

12-13 octobre 2007

SCOTLAND

ALBA

Résumés
Abstracts

« Écosse : l'identité nationale en question / Questioning national identity »
VIe colloque de la SFEE – Université de Nantes, 12 et 13 octobre 2007

2

RÉSUMÉS / ABSTRACTS

• **AUER, Christian** (Université Marc Bloch, Strasbourg) - **Le culte de William Wallace dans l'Écosse victorienne et édouardienne : signe d'une affirmation identitaire nationale ?**

L'Écosse victorienne voua une véritable vénération à William Wallace, ce héros issu du peuple qui remporta une victoire historique sur les Anglais à Stirling en 1297. Comme l'affirme Tom Devine, dans un article paru dans le Scotsman en août 2005, « there can be little doubt that Wallace was one of the supreme Victorian icons ». Murray Pittock, quant à lui, parle de « powerful recrudescence of pro-Wallace feeling and of a Wallace cult in the nineteenth and early twentieth century »[1]. Des statues en l'honneur de Wallace furent érigées dans de nombreux endroits d'Écosse et le National Wallace Monument, dont la construction prit fin en 1869, reste pour de nombreux Ecossais le symbole de la résistance à l'oppression anglaise. Or cette vénération pour le personnage de Wallace eut lieu à une époque où l'Écosse se caractérisait par une absence de revendications nationales. Michel Duchein estime par exemple que ce qui définissait la vie politique écossaise, entre 1850 et 1914, était « sa totale intégration à la vie politique britannique dans son ensemble»[2].
Je m'efforcerai de démontrer que la passion de l'Écosse victorienne pour le personnage de Wallace ne saurait être interprétée comme la manifestation d'une idéologie anti unioniste ou anti anglaise ; certains voyaient en Wallace le symbole de la résistance à l'oppression aristocratique, qu'elle soit écossaise ou anglaise, d'autres s'y référaient pour mettre en avant les valeurs de méritocratie inhérentes au peuple écossais. Il convient donc de parler de caractère pluriel de la symbolique de Wallace. J'illustrerai mon propos en prenant comme exemple le cas des femmes militantes d'Écosse qui luttèrent pour obtenir les mêmes droits civiques que les hommes : ces femmes utilisèrent le personnage de Wallace pour manifester l'indéfectible attachement à leur cause et surtout leur opposition à la domination masculine. C'est ainsi que le symbole de la résistance de la nation écossaise à l'Angleterre revenait le symbole de la résistance à l'oppresseur masculin. Je conclurai en indiquant que la symbolique véhiculée par un personnage historique emblématique peut varier et fluctuer non seulement en fonction des époques mais également en fonction des groupes sociaux qui l'utilisent.

[1] M. Pittock, The Invention of Tradition, Londres: Routledge, 1991, p. 118.

[2] M. Duchein, Histoire de l'Écosse, Paris : Fayard, 1998, p. 432.

« Écosse : l'identité nationale en question / Questioning national identity »
VIe colloque de la SFEE - Université de Nantes, 12 et 13 octobre 2007

3

• **BERTON-CHARRIÈRE, Danièle** (Université Blaise Pascal, Clermont-Ferrand) – **Mythe et identité dans** *The Triumphs of Re-United Britannia* **d'Anthony Munday.**

Rencontre du spectaculaire et du politique, *The Triumphs of Re-United Britannia* a été pensé et créé comme divertissant, didactique, commémoratif et propagandiste. Écrit par Anthony Munday à l'occasion de l'entrée de Sir Leonard Holliday dans la Cité de Londres en sa qualité de « Lord Mayor » le mardi 29 octobre 1605, cette « pièce » protocolaire et édifiante combine idéologie et arts visuels. Elle rappelle et met en scène la genèse et l'histoire mythiques de la nation —une, puis composite— dans ses phases de construction et de division. La reconstitution théâtralisée et ritualisée sous forme de « pageant » défend la proposition d'une ré/union initiée par Jacques VI-I, présentée comme une véritable bénédiction.

• **BERTON, Jean** (Université Jean Monnet, Saint-Etienne) - **Les anthologies et histoires littéraires de la Renaissance écossaise, un enjeu d'identité.**

Les anthologies et les histoires littéraires écossaises sont apparues au début du XXe siècle, se sont affirmées dans l'entre-deux-guerres et se sont développées de manière exponentielle dès les années 1950. Cette étude vise à explorer le phénomène pour le relier à la question de l'identité écossaise. Dans son intervention intitulée 'Poetry and the Nation, 1707—2007' lors du colloque « Debateable Lands » de mai 2007 à Dumfries, Alan Riach reliait les concepts d'identité, de possession et de pouvoir dans la force de la poésie écossaise ; parallèlement, on peut avancer l'hypothèse suivante à propos des histoires littéraires et des anthologies : elles ont pour fonction de réaffirmer une identité culturelle, puis de se la réapproprier, dans le but de reprendre le pouvoir (dans l'absolu).
La littérature a montré l'importance de son rôle dans l'indépendance des nations ; et la force d'un poème, d'une chanson, d'une ballade ou d'un récit dans l'histoire d'un pays peut être considérable. De même, la simplicité de la première phrase du premier article du premier numéro de *Scottish Literary News* de 1970 a la force d'un coup de semonce : « During the session 1969-70 the English Literature Department of Edinburgh University, in collaboration with the School of Scottish Studies, offered for the first time an Ordinary Course in Scottish Literature. » Avec le recul dont nous bénéficions et les preuves que fournissent les anthologies et les histoires littéraires, nous pouvons associer étroitement la littérature écossaise à son identité nationale.

Identity at stake in the histories of Scottish literature of the Renaissance & Revival periods.

The first anthologies and histories of Scottish literature were published at the turn of the 20th century; in the wake of WW I they were vested with a national importance; and they appeared in numbers during the Revival period. This paper intends to visit the phenomenon and link it to the Scottish identity issue. In his talk, 'Poetry and the Nation 1707 - 2007' given at the ASLS conference 'Debateable Lands' held in May 2007 in Dumfries, Alan Riach connected the notions of identity, possession and power forcefully expressed in Scottish poetry. I am putting forward the following analogy concerning literary anthologies and histories - they are meant to state a cultural identity and 'possess' it with a view to seizing power, in absolute terms.
Literature has proved how important it could be to independent nations - and the power of a poem, a song, a ballad or a tale can be considerable in a nation's history. Likewise, the simplicity of the first sentence in the first article of the first number of Scottish Literary News in 1970 is as powerful as a warning shot: 'During the session 1969-70 the English Literature Department of Edinburgh University, in collaboration with the School of Scottish

« Écosse : l'identité nationale en question / Questioning national identity »
VIe colloque de la SFEE – Université de Nantes, 12 et 13 octobre 2007

4

Studies, offered for the first time an Ordinary Course in Scottish Literature.' Some forty years later, we can say that Scottish anthologies and histories have shown that Scottish literature can be associated with Scotland's national identity.

• **CAMP, Edwige** (Université de Valenciennes) - **La reconnaissance de la Saint André comme jour férié, un symbole identitaire pour le Parlement écossais.**

Le 29 novembre 2006, le Parlement écossais se prononça à l'unanimité pour donner aux employeurs la possibilité d'accorder un jour de congé le 30 novembre, pour fêter la Saint André, patron de l'Écosse. Les députés consacrèrent ainsi un symbole de l'identité nationale. Ce vote marquait l'aboutissement de deux ans de travaux parlementaires. Les tergiversations ne résultaient pas du choix de la Saint André, d'autant plus acceptable par tous qu'il n'était pas Ecossais et qu'il constitue le patron de différents pays et corporations. Les députés se divisèrent davantage sur les conséquences de cette désignation au plan économique.

• **CARBONI, Pierre** (Université de Nantes) – **James Thomson's « Patriotic » Poetry: the Union Poet as a « Caledonian ».**

Because of its author's unconditional commitment to whig politics, Thomson's poetry is identified with the Union's cause and its Scottish dimension often misunderstood. A staunch supporter of the political, economic and cultural transformations which affected the Scottish nation in the wake of the Treaty of 1707, Thomson describes his native land as England's partner in the new British state. Despite its anglocentric bias, his picture of Scotland's, or rather North Britain's cultural contribution to the new multinational state proved instrumental in the re-shaping of Scottish identity in a difficult period. Thomson's poetic-prophetic vision of his fellow North Britons as modern Caledonians, whose national character paradoxically survives and flourishes in defending the Union's values, is the prototype of the literary constructions of Scotland (and, implicitly, of the Scottish poet's distinctive role and status in British society) before the rise of modern nationalism.

• **CIVARDI, Christian** (Université Marc Bloch, Strasbourg) - **La classe ou la nation ? Histoire d'un conflit de loyautés, 1886-2007.**

De la création de la *Scottish Home Rule Association* en 1886, puis du *Scottish Labour Party* deux ans plus tard, aux élections écossaises de 2007, cette communication examine les positions des tenants de l'émancipation nationale et de ceux de la lutte des classes, et dégage la synthèse de leur confrontation dialectique : l'invention d'une identité nationale de classe, voire d'une nation-classe.

Class vs. Nation : Conflicting loyalties, 1886-2007
Are national liberation and the class struggle incompatible, or complementary? This paper charts the course of that dilemma, from the foundations of the Scottish Home Rule Association in 1886 and of the Scottish Labour Party in 1888 to the Holyrood election of 2007, and studies the attempt at reconciling its two horns by producing a class-based national identity.

« Écosse : l'identité nationale en question / Questioning national identity »
VIe colloque de la SFEE – Université de Nantes, 12 et 13 octobre 2007

5

• **DUCLOS Nathalie** (Université de Toulouse-Le Mirail) – **What is 'Scottish' about the Scottish Parliament and Executive?**

A comparative analysis of parliamentary systems shows that despite the recurrence of the topos of novelty in Scottish political discourse, there is not much which is specifically Scottish or distinctive about the Scottish parliamentary system, which is a hybrid mix between the Westminster and Western European models. That the Westminster legacy should not be acknowledged is easy enough to understand in the context of a sub-state level of power, so this paper will rather focus on the European side of the equation. What parliamentary systems did Home Rulers look into? Where do some of the 'distinctive' characteristics of the Scottish model come from, and where was it claimed they came from?

• **GRAHAM, Lesley** (Université de Bordeaux II) – **National Identity and Transference in John Scott's « A Visit to Paris in 1814 ».**

John Scott left his native Aberdeen in 1800 and moved to London where, after a spell at the War office, he joined the staff of The Champion. In 1814 after the abdication of Napoleon, he joined many other Britons hastening across the Channel to take advantage of this the first opportunity they had had to visit France since 1802. A series of articles for the newspaper resulted from this trip which later became a book. He returned to France twice for prolonged visits in the following years and two further books were published. In all of the books, Scott's criticism of France is consistently scathing as is his opinion of Scotland — discernable in the unflattering parallels he draws between the two countries. In this paper, I argue that his criticism of France and Scotland are the result of a process of transference in which he invests in the former country negative qualities founded in memories of the latter. I further argue that this process is a sign of Scott's ongoing discursive construction of a new national identity for himself.

• **HAYES, Win** (University of Edinburgh) – **Sport and National Identity in Scotland.**

National identity in Scotland, although often superficially focussed on the traditional representations of tartan, bagpipes and haggis or more fundamentally on distinction and separation from England, is certainly different from the national identity of each of the other countries of the United Kingdom or of the four home countries collectively. Fundamentally underpinned by its separate origins and the sense of difference remaining after the Act of Union in 1707 this national identity is both embedded in history and evolving over time reflecting the society and culture of the people. Sport, an activity that utilises so much of the population's time and physical and emotional energy, is an acknowledged element of popular culture. The importance of sport in national identity can be seen world wide as in the Gaelic Athletic Association activity in Ireland in the late nineteenth and early twentieth century and the role of cricket during the 1950s and early 1960s in reflecting nationhood and identity for the Caribbean countries. As such it reflects the political and social position of the country as well as the passions and tensions of the people. This paper, through the study of a range of popular sporting activities in Scotland during the nineteenth and twentieth century, will examine the role of sport over the years in establishing national and community identity.

« Écosse : l'identité nationale en question / Questioning national identity »
VIe colloque de la SFEE - Université de Nantes, 12 et 13 octobre 2007

6

• **JUILLET, Sabrina** (Université de Versailles Saint Quentin) – **Les Églises nationales face à l'Union de 1707.**

Ennemis et concurrents de toujours, l'Angleterre et l'Écosse se sont malgré tout unies par leurs couronnes en 1603 puis institutionnellement en 1707 pour former la Grande Bretagne. Cette union fut pour beaucoup étonnante et provoqua de nombreuses réactions négatives, particulièrement en Écosse. Mais les besoins économiques de cette dernières et la nécessité de garantir une succession protestante de la monarchie sur l'Ile britannique pour l'Angleterre eurent raison de l'opposition. Or dans de telles conditions, l'avenir de l'union était compromis. En effet, une union sans unité ne pouvait durer et celle-ci était loin d'être évidente entre les deux nations. Au contraire, cette situation les a motivées à développer leurs différences, en faisant petit à petit des armes de lutte identitaire. La question de la religion et de l'Église fut certainement l'une des plus puissantes d'entre elles. Paradoxalement, c'est aussi cette dernière qui a, au fil des années, permis d'établir une certaine unité entre les deux nations. L'introduction de l'acte d'union de 1707 confirme cette situation en garantissant une Église presbytérienne à l'Écosse, condition sine qua non à l'union, car elle en faisait officiellement une spécificité nationale pour ce pays peu enclin à se fondre totalement à l'Angleterre. Cette introduction n'est en réalité que la conclusion d'un combat acharné de la majorité des Ecossais pour se différencier de l'Angleterre par la religion. Malgré plusieurs tentatives d'union religieuse qui ont toutes échouées, il a toutefois permis aux deux nations de renforcer le protestantisme sur leur Ile. Nous nous proposons d'examiner la manière dont l'Église est devenue un outil de différenciation identitaire nationale au sein de l'union à travers une étude de l'Église et de la société écossaise durant les années qui ont précédé la naissance de la Grande Bretagne. Nous mettrons ainsi en évidence les enjeux de la religion pour les débats et la mise en pratique de l'union qui allait être établie.

• **LAPLACE, Philippe** (Université de Besançon) – **Intelligent Men's Guides to Albyn: (re)definitions of identity and the (Re)naissance.**

Cette communication étudie les principaux écrits publiés en Écosse dans les années 1935 et 1936 et propose de considérer comment les auteurs de cette période redéfinirent les concepts d'une identité écossaise afin d'illustrer leurs ambitions et leurs vœux politiques.
L'essai polémique de Gibbon et MacDiarmid *Scottish Scene* (1934) sera au centre des considérations, mais nous étudierons également certains des ouvrages appartenant à la collection « The Voice of Scotland » (9 ouvrages publiés entre1935-36) et certains articles de *The Left Review* consacrée à l'Écosse (1935). Ces écrits nous permettront de considérer comment les thèmes les plus pertinents à une identité écossaise et à son expression furent tour à tour mis à mal puis redéfinis par les écrivains qui composaient le mouvement et qui s'engagèrent dans la série ou dans le mouvement intellectuel de la Renaissance écossaise. L'histoire fut par exemple le premier élément que Grassic Gibbon voulut redéfinir (dans *Scottish Scene*). Il prit ainsi le contrepied de la plupart des théories avancées jusque-là, rejetant à la fois l'influence celte et scandinave pour se concentrer sur les pictes, qu'il considérait être à la source de l'identité et de l'âme écossaises. Gibbon fit toutefois cavalier seul, la plupart des écrivains ayant contribué à « The Voice of Scotland » préférant épouser les influences celtes ou scandinaves pour définir l'identité écossaise. La littérature et la langue qui, entre autres à cause d'un article écrit par T. S. Eliot en 1919, avaient servi de plateforme à Hugh MacDiarmid pour lancer sa Renaissance écossaise, furent paradoxalement la pierre d'achoppement qui rompit la dynamique et la cohésion de la Renaissance écossaise. Les écrivains de cette période se démontrèrent leur engagement sur ces sujets : Gibbon et MacDiarmid s'accordèrent pour rejeter les œuvres écrites en anglais du canon de la Renaissance écossaise telle qu'ils l'envisageaient ; les autres écrivains de « The Voice of Scotland » furent en revanche assez critiques des positions

« Écosse : l'identité nationale en question / Questioning national identity »
VIe colloque de la SFEE - Université de Nantes, 12 et 13 octobre 2007

7

extrémistes embrassées par MacDiarmid en ce qui concernait la langue et tentèrent de redéfinir l'apport linguistique ou de rejeter cette influence dans les (re)définitions d'une identité écossaise. Mais nous verrons que ce qui cependant servit de dénominateur commun à tous les écrivains de cette période pour la (re)définition d'une identité écossaise fut la notion de « territoire » telle que Gibbon l'avait brillament formulée dans *A Scots Quair* et dans *Scottish Scene*.

• **LEISHMAN, David** (Université de Grenoble III) – **"The primordial beginnings of the race" and all that jazz: Scottish national identity in Jackie Kay's** *Trumpet*.

Descriptions of Scottishness which implied a hereditary or essentialist conception of national identity were still surprisingly frequent in the late twentieth century. Despite the precedents in European history which clearly sounded the dangers of peremptory and exclusive conceptions of nationhood and nationalism, the necessary link between the nation's present and its past could still frequently be found expressed in terms of unbroken lineage and ancestral heritage. This was also true in analyses of Scotland's national culture and literature, other key elements of any national identity. As if to counter such interpretations of Scottishness, Jackie Kay's novel *Trumpet* focuses on the theme of genealogical discontinuity. Although the central character - a cross-dressing jazz musician - links the disruption of the biological sphere to sexual and gender identity, the novel's preoccupation with orphans, hybrids and immigrants also links these questions to issues of national identity. Contrasting with the tenuous nature of blood ties, it is the power inherent in language, narrative and the act of naming that is associated with a capacity to structure experience and confer identity.

• **LEYDIER, Gilles** (Université du Sud Toulon-Var) – **Identité écossaise, identité britannique : réflexions autour de l'évolution récente d'un vieux clivage.**

Depuis une vingtaine d'années et les premières études de Moreno, la question de l'identité nationale fait l'objet en Écosse de très nombreuses enquêtes sociologiques, en parallèle des débats autour du changement constitutionnel. Au cours des années 1990, les multiples études qui ont exploré la dualité identitaire écossaise ont d'une façon générale conclu à l'affirmation d'une *Scottishness* –et/ou à une augmentation de l'identification à celle-ci- en même temps que s'exprimaient des critiques sur le fonctionnement de l'Union et que se manifestait dans l'opinion écossaise un déclin progressif d'une *Britishness* de plus en plus problématique. Une décennie après la mise en place de la dévolution institutionnelle, il apparaît intéressant de faire le point sur ces enjeux. Le rétablissement du Parlement écossais, traduction politique concrète d'une identité nationale écossaise spécifique, a-t-il eu pour effet d'accentuer dans la population l'importance de cette *Scottishness*? Ou au contraire la mise en pratique au quotidien de la dévolution politique conduit-elle à rendre moins nécessaire chez les Ecossais leurs revendications identitaires ? D'autre part la mise en avant d'une *Scottishness* civique, ouverte et inclusive par les responsables politiques désormais en charge des affaires écossaises, correspond-t-elle à la réalité sociologique de la population écossaise? Enfin la mise en route de la dévolution a-t-elle eu un impact, positif ou négatif, sur les interrogations identitaires autour de la *Britishness* en Écosse?

« Écosse : l'identité nationale en question / Questioning national identity »
VIe colloque de la SFEE - Université de Nantes, 12 et 13 octobre 2007

8

• **MONNICKENDAM, Andrew** (Universitat Autónoma de Barcelona) - **Having your (oat)cake and eating it: The question of double identities in Scottish literature and culture.**

This paper is divided into two parts: the first tries to unravel one of the key mysteries in Scott's life - and death; the second applies its findings to our contemporary age.

The Malachi controversy demonstrates that Scott has two very clear personal traits. First, he can express extremely strong opinions; second, he is a staunch defender of Scottish symbols, particularly such a metonymic one as currency. Lockhart, in his huge biography, tries to undermine that picture in two ways. First, Scott is seen, in normal circumstances, as a gentle, rational person, unlikely ever to get involved in heated arguments about identity. Second, and more strikingly, what stirs Scott to action in Malachi is, in second place, the defence of a Scottish issue, but primarily Scott believes he is participating in an argument about universals, about right or wrong. Thus, Lockhart concludes, Scott would have defended a similar, just cause if the victim of injustice were England or something English.

Is the Lockhart defence a case of having your cake and eating it? This paper will explore the issue by concentrating on two areas. The first will be how such ambivalence is explored by Scott's contemporaries; second, whether this issue is anyway closer to being resolved in 2007.

• **MUNRO-LANDI, Morag** (Université de Pau et des Pays de l'Adour)- **Neil Gunn's Nationalist Sentiment**

Given the current success of the Scottish National Party in Holyrood and the very existence of the new parliament since the 1998 devolution acts, it seems to be worth going back to the early, however tentative, days of the party to consider a writer who always placed Scotland and things Scottish at the heart of his preoccupations. Renaissance novelist Neil Gunn's nationalist sentiment is thus presented as a presupposition, despite the few references in historical works to the actual role played by his political vision in helping, albeit backstage, the divided national parties in the late twenties and early thirties find common ground to form the Scottish National Party in 1934. The aim of this paper is to examine Gunn's political and cultural nationalist discourse as expressed in selected extracts from critical works, correspondence, essays and fiction, with in mind perhaps some kind of "political rehabilitation" of Gunn …? The evolution of his views, over the thirties and forties in relation to events at home and abroad, both in his fiction and non-fiction writing, shows a shift from the depiction of the Highlands and Scotland dispossessed to the more positive desire to see Scotland regenerated, affirming its otherness compared to mainstream Britain.

• **PENTLAND, Gordon** (University of Edinburgh) - **"Like Jews they Spread,/ And as Infection Fly": Scots and Jews in English Political Culture, *c.* 1750-1832.**

By examining a range of media (political prints, magazines, newspapers, pamphlets) this paper aims to explore a number of the similarities between representations of and ideas and arguments about Jewish and Scottish minorities in England in the second half of the long eighteenth century. In so doing it aims to use comparison to throw into relief the role of ideas about Scotland and Scots in English political culture. The hostility to Scots from 1745 and during the 1760s is well known, but the actual content of hostile propaganda has been less well served. Nor has the theme of a politicized anti-Scottishness been followed

through for the period following the short Bute premiership. This is in spite of the fact that there was considerable animus directed against politicians like Henry Dundas, 1st Viscount Melville, Pitt the Younger's staunch parliamentary ally and the last British politician to be impeached. Similarly, the most prolific political journalist of the early nineteenth century, William Cobbett, consistently pilloried 'Scotch feelosophers' and the 'Scottish faction who ruled England and disposed of its riches at pleasure'. By exploring one facet of this hostility - comparisons between Scots and Jews - this paper aims to highlight the contingent and non-linear nature of a growth of Britishness and to suggest the importance of exploring the 'Englishness' of English political culture.

• TALBOTT, Siobhan (University of St Andrews) - **Identity and Union: the Scottish Diaspora in France, 1707-1718.**

Too often, historians have made the assumption that Scots in France during the Jacobite period (1689-1746) were automatically sympathetic to the Jacobite cause, therefore identifying themselves strongly with the Stuart vision of Jacobite Scotland. This paper will test this hypothesis against a study of several members of the settled Scottish community in France, in order to establish just how many of them identified with the Jacobite cause, how many were sympathetic to the regime of Queen Anne and the Hanoverian dynasty that succeeded her, and how many simply enjoyed living in France and remained aloof from any form of political or religious intrigue.

From the exile of the Jacobites from Scotland in 1689, and the accession to the throne of William of Orange, Scotsmen found their way to France, where they undertook a number of positions, both in the army and in civic administration. Complications arose in the post-1707 period, when the British Union added to an already complicated layering of identity in the Franco-Scottish community. The 1707-18 period witnessed one minor and one major attempt to restore the Jacobites by force (1708 and 1715), and after each event, further exiles arrived in France. Yet at the same time, Scots loyal to the new British state also continued to arrive, and have remained understudied; in particular high ranking ambassadors such as the Earl of Stair, who arrived in 1714. In 1718, the Jacobite court moved to Rome after being asked to leave France, dramatically changing the makeup of the Scottish community in France after this time.

In order to make this study feasible, I have selected three geographic locations; Paris, La Rochelle and Nantes. I will be scrutinising documents from British government sources, from Jacobite repositories and from various archival collections in order to investigate how Scots in these locations during the turbulent period surrounding the British Union of 1707 viewed themselves, as well as how their identity was perceived by others.

• TATHAM, Robert (Université de Chambéry) - **Broadcasting and Scottish Identity.**

Broadcasting is seldom included amongst the many political and cultural factors that are said to bind nations together. And yet radio and television surely play an important role in national consciousness.

This seems to be confirmed by the new Scottish government, which has pressed for a Scottish television channel, and by the ensuing debate on the web!

Scottish broadcasting was traditionally dominated by **the BBC**, which has claimed to both unite the British nation and at the same time serve Scotland through local and national services. Most subsequent broadcasters have also had to consider their relations with the Scots, but **little** appears to have been published on the topic.

Our aim is thus to study Scottish broadcasting in an endeavour to throw light on the question of Scottish identity.

« Écosse : l'identité nationale en question / Questioning national identity »
VIe colloque de la SFEE – Université de Nantes, 12 et 13 octobre 2007

10

We shall focus on **three main historical periods**, starting with the creation of the BBC and its Scottish services. Then came the commercial broadcasters, including Independent Television (ITV), the offshore pirate stations of the 1960s and the later local radio networks. The third part will cover more recent developments, especially the expansion of radio, Gaelic language broadcasts and current discussions about Scottish digital TV channels. For each period we intend to examine various aspects that are linked to identity, such as broadcasting policies, programmes and audience ratings.

We expect our findings to relate to matters such as awareness of Scottish nationhood, the nature of Scottish society, the language issues and various cultural questions. In particular we plan to analyse some of the relationships between broadcasting and Scottish identity. An attempt will be made to set Scottish experience in an international context by making some comparisons with other countries.

• **THIEC, Annie** (Université de Nantes) – **Rethinking National Identity in 21st century Scotland.**

The Scottish Referendum Survey 1997 showed that the Scots had said 'Yes' to the setting-up of a Parliament for Scotland because they expected the new Scottish Parliament to improve the quality of their lives, especially in terms of social policy, rather than because they saw the Parliament as an expression of their Scottish identity. Yet when people in Scotland are interviewed about their perceptions of their own national identity/ies, notably in the Scottish Social Attitudes Surveys, not only do two thirds of them put their Scottish identity first, but it appears that when national identity is measured against other identities such as gender, parenthood or class, being Scottish is a very important element of their self-identity.

Prior to devolution, the political debate in Scotland centred on the 'democratic deficit' and on the demand for constitutional reform. As devolution became a reality, however, the debate moved on to a reflection on Scotland's society in the 21st century and on the meaning of being Scottish, with a focus on the 'multicultural' nature of Scotland's society. The Scottish Executive under the Labour/Liberal-Democrat coalition launched campaigns and initiatives aimed at promoting a welcoming and inclusive Scotland, in the same way as the Scottish National Party, in office since May 2007, has itself also long promoted an open, civic Scottish identity. To what extent is the vision of the political elites of an inclusive Scottish society shared by the people of Scotland?

• **WILSON-COSTA, Karyn** (Université de Provence) – **The Invention of a Nation: Calum Colvin's *Ossian, Fragments of Ancient Poetry*.**

In the wake of devolution, the question of Scottish identity and what it means to be Scottish has never been so hotly debated. Calum Colvin, one of Scotland's most innovative artists, has mounted an itinerant exhibition entitled *Ossian, Fragments of Ancient Poetry*, centred on the story of James Macpherson's *Ossian.* Colvin uses these epic tales as a vehicle for a reflection on the authenticity of Scotland's national identity which he sees as stereotyped. By peeling away the layers of historical image-making, he aims to show how the Scots have lost track of what is real, what is constructed and what is merely "romantic nonsense".

The importance of the Scottish icons of heritage as signifiers of identity underpins this exhibition, and Colvin dedicates two of the works to Robert Burns, one of the greatest of Scotland's national heroes and cultural icons. By linking Burns to Ossian, Colvin reasserts the former's Highland credentials and profound influence on the development of nineteenth-century Highland imagery through the Ossianic landscapes in the illustrations of his poems. In the *Twa Dogs,* the title and theme of which are taken from Burns's satirical

poem, Colvin makes his most incisive comment on the unresolved conflicts at the heart of what remains for him an unattainable "identity". He alludes to the primeval hostility between the *Rangers* and *Celtic* football clubs, symbols of the unsettled conflict between the Celtic and British identity in Scotland today. Since the dogs face in opposite directions, he may be suggesting that these fundamental conflicts will never be solved. Burns, the most "clubbable" of bards, who constructed his own brand of cultural nationalism in his club poetry, has, however, a more optimistic vision of Scotland's future.

This paper will examine how Calum Colvin deconstructs the historical and literary images which obscure Scotland's culture and whether, as he suggests, Scottish identity will always be a story of perpetual discord. It will focus on the presence of Robert Burns in the exhibition and the ways in which he has been used to construct an idea of "Scottishness" in the collective imagination.

• **YOUNG, John** (University of Strathclyde, Glasgow) - **New Perspectives on the 1707 Anglo-Scottish Union.**

The 300th anniversary of the 1707 union has witnessed the publication of several new scholarly books on this key event in Scottish history. I reviewed three of these new books in The Scottish Review of Books, volume 3, number 1, 2007. This was distributed with The Sunday Herald several months ago. Since then, another research monograph on public opinion and the Union has just been published and two further books (on the Church of Scotland and the Union, and a biography of the Duke of Queensberry, one of the main Scottish politicians responsible for the Union) will be published over the next month or so. In essence, a new research agenda has emerged and the 1707 union has gone through a historiographical re-evaluation. These books are based on original research and they will make a significant contribution to the Union historiography. Some of these books also have a wider significance in terms of Scottish identity. A persuasive argument is made in some of these books for the unpopularity of Jacobitism, a Catholic Jacobite on the Scottish throne and the fear of Catholic France under Louis XIV (especially in terms of the persecution of the Huguenots). In turn, there is now a very strong argument for the rehabilitation of presbyterianism as a crucial part of Scotland's identity formation in the past.

Scottish identity does not consist of Highland Jacobitism (as we all know anyway), but the popularity, support and impact of Lowland Scottish presbyterianism has tended to have been ignored. Anti-Jacobite sentiment was strong and Glasgow, for example, was essentially a Hanoverian city (place names, architecture etc).

Therefore the historical reality of Scotland's past is often at odds with the picture painted for the outside world or indeed the outside world's perception and view of Scotland and Scottish history.